Statutory Limitations in Children's Rights Protection under

2 Cameroonian Legal Systems

3 Elvis Fokala

- 4 https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3631-0628
- 5 Centre for Human Rights,
- 6 Faculty of Law, University of Pretoria
- 7 elvis.fokala@up.ac.za

8 Abstract

9

10 11

12 13

14

15 16

17 18

19

20 21

22

23

24 25 In terms of Article 1(1) of the of the African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child (African Children's Charter), state parties are encouraged to recognise the rights, freedoms and duties enshrined in this Charter and to undertake the necessary steps, in accordance with their Constitutional processes and with the provisions of the present Charter, to adopt such legislative or other measures as may be necessary to give effect to the provisions of the African Children's Charter. Legislation is one of the most powerful instruments a government has to regulate society and protect its citizens within its national territory. It also outlines the rights and responsibilities of individuals and authorities for whom legislation is intended to protect and govern. However, no amount of legislation will have value if there is neither discipline nor enforcement mechanisms, for example, through the establishment of key institutions. This article sets out to evaluate the sufficiency of the laws and institutions with a mandate to protect children's rights in Cameroon.

Keywords: Cameroon; African Children's Charter; children's rights; child law; state obligation



26 Introduction

27

28

29 30

31

32

33

34 35

36

37

38 39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48 49

50 51

52

53

54

55

56 57 The African Children's Committee adopted its Rules of Procedure and Guidelines on State Reporting during its second session in 2002.¹ As indicated in its title, this instrument is a guideline, aimed to assist state parties to the African Children's Charter to report adequately to the committee. Under international human rights law, only state parties to a particular instrument are obliged to report to the monitoring organ of that instrument.² Cameroon ratified the African Children's Charter on 5 September 1997. Following its accession to the Charter, the state submitted its initial report on 29 September 2003.³ According to article 43 of the Charter, a state party is required to submit its initial report within two years after it accedes to the Charter. Akin to most state parties to the African Children's Charter, Cameroon's initial report was late. Cameroon's report was submitted six years after the state acceded to the Charter (1997 to 2003). However, despite this lethargic start, the State has maintained an impressive record in relation to submitting its periodic reports to the committee.

According to the African Children's Committee, thirty-eight out of fifty state parties to the Charter have submitted initial reports of which nine have submitted the first periodic report.⁴ This is encouraging as it is only through state reports that the committee can assess and make observations on the state of a state party's domestication and implementation of the Charter, its recommendations, decisions and concluding observations. For example, through its reports to the African Children's Committee, Cameroon has continuously provided and updated the committee on the legal and policy reforms made at the national level to ensure the protection of children's rights within its national territory. However, there seems to be a disconnect between what is being reported in the state party reports and the reality in Cameroon. Thus, the focus of this article is to investigate two key issues. The first is to establish whether both in law and practice, the statutes highlighted in Cameroon state party reports exist and are applicable. Secondly, it will be ascertained, from an administrative and institutional viewpoint, whether the state has, indeed established the requisite institutions to enable the proper implementation of children's rights at the national level. Overall, seen through an analytical human rights lens framed by the African Children's Charter, this contribution seeks to investigate the gaps that exist in Cameroon's statutory protection of children's rights.

¹ A Lloyd, 'The first meeting of the African Committee of Experts on the Rights and Welfare of the Child' 2002 AHRJ 320.

See for example, the general guidelines for reporting, to the UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, available at <file:///C:/Users/u05127913/Downloads/GL032748.pdf> 20-46 accessed 17 January 2021.

^{3 &}lt;a href="https://www.acerwc.africa/initial-and-periodic-reports/">https://www.acerwc.africa/initial-and-periodic-reports/ accessed 7 October 2019.

⁴ ACERWC's webpage https://reporting.acerwc.africa/StateReportsConcludingObservations accessed 17 January 2021.

58 This contribution is limited to Cameroon's reporting record to the African Children's 59 Committee. It does not, for example, investigate Cameroon's reporting record to the Committee on the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (Committee 60 on the CRC).⁵ However, because Cameroon is a party to both treaties, overlaps cannot 61 be completely avoided. Where such overlaps occur, the intention will be to draw some 62 comparative analyses of Cameroon's commitment to both monitoring bodies and 63 reference specific aspects that also speak to the crux of this contribution. The article 64 also does not analyse the current restive situation in the English-speaking regions in 65 Cameroon and its resultant effects on children who are now internally displaced while 66 their rights are perpetually being violated. The article is divided into six main sections 67 including the introduction and concluding sections. The sub-sections are mainly tailored 68 to outline existing gaps and make practical suggestions to strengthen Cameroon's 69 70 children rights protection mechanisms.

71 Cameroon the State Party—The State of Children's Rights Protection in Cameroon

An Insight into the Wellbeing of Children in Cameroon

- From a national legislative perspective, the State of Cameroon has made minimal efforts 73 to protect its children through the enactment of laws. The struggles of children in 74 Cameroon are aggravated by rigid bureaucratic challenges hindering them from thriving 75 beyond an ordinary and difficult childhood. These include, but are not limited to, 76 77 inadequate implementation of the limited existing sectoral laws and policies intended to assist children, unsatisfactory budgetary allocation for services related to children, such 78 as education and health care, compounded by an endemic mismanagement of resources 79 by officials. 80
- According to a 2008 report published by the African Child Policy Forum (ACPF),⁶
 Cameroon is a 'less child-friendly' state.⁷ In this report, the ACPF provides an in-depth
 analysis of the state of African states' legal and policy frameworks for child protection,
 states' budgetary allocations to services related to children, and notable successes at
 state level for children's rights protection.⁸ Four years after the ACPF's report, the 2012
 United States Bureau of Democracy's Human Rights Report on Cameroon paints a

⁵ Cameroon ratified the CRC on 11 January 1993 https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?src=IND&mtdsg_no=IV-11&chapter=4&lang=en accessed 20 November 2019.

The African Child Policy Forum is an independent, non-profit, pan-African institution of policy research and dialogue on the African child. The Forum has a rich track record in data analysis and comparative and analytical research on children's rights in Africa.

The African Child Policy Forum, *The African Report on Child Wellbeing: How Child-friendly are African Governments?* (Addis Ababa, The African Child Policy Forum 2008) 7.

A Bequele, 'Monitoring the Commitment and Child-friendliness of Governments: A New Approach from Africa' *Child Abuse & Neglect* (Elsevier 2010) 34–44.

rather bleak picture.⁹ In that report, child abuse, amongst others, is highlighted as a significant problem in Cameroon.¹⁰ Also, when the ACPF published its updated report in 2013, the situation had not improved and consequently, the state was still classified a less child-friendly state and labelled further as one of the countries that 'showed a sharp fall in ranking' from the 2008 index. ¹¹ In 2018, in its third successive report on child well-being in Africa, the ACPF classified Cameroon as a country out of step with international and African Union (AU) standards.¹² More specifically, in the 2018 Report, the ACPF classified Cameroon as a state that still endorses child marriage.¹³ Based on these, it is therefore not surprising that, in its decision on the communication submitted by the *Institute for Human Right and Development in Africa and Finders Group Initiative on Behalf of TFA (a Minor) v the Government of the Republic of Cameroon*, which also highlights the low-spirited reality in Cameroon, amongst others, the African Children's Committee called on Cameroon to '[e]nact and implement a legislation eliminating all forms of violence, including sexual violence against children.'¹⁴

The Constitution of Cameroon

Akin to most constitutions around the world, Cameroon's Constitution is the leading Act of parliament at the domestic level. It is also the leading law of the land. However, the 1996 Constitution of Cameroon is a typical ideological Constitution with no clear intention to ensure the protection of the rights of the most vulnerable children in the twenty-first century. This Constitution has been amended several times. However, the amendments have not addressed the inclusion or strengthening of the constitutional protection of children's rights. As a state party to the African Children's Charter, for example, Cameroon has an irrefutable mandate under article 1 of the Charter to:

Undertake the necessary steps, in accordance with their Constitutional processes and with the provisions of the present Charter, to adopt such legislative or other measures as may be necessary to give effect to the provisions of this Charter.

This has not been adhered to and the current pace at which Cameroon enacts its major legislation, suggests that it might not happen soon. Despite the fact that the current Constitution is largely flawed by huge rights-based gaps with rigid rules and regulations

See eg, United States Department of State Bureau of Democracy 2012 report on human rights in Cameroon available at http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/204309.pdf> accessed 23 January 2019.

¹⁰ ibid.

¹¹ The African Child Policy Forum (n 7) 39–47.

¹² ibid (2018) 20–27.

¹³ ibid

¹⁴ Institute for Human Rights and Development in Africa and Finders Group Initiative on behalf of TFA (a minor) v the government the Republic of Cameroon, Communication No: 006/Com/002/2015 Decision No:001/2018 16.

Amended in 2008 by Law No. 2008-1 of April 14, (to Amend and Supplement some Provisions of Law No. 96-6 of January 18, 1996 to Amend the Constitution of June 2, 1972).

proliferating from the different sections of government, the state does not seem interested in incorporating human rights or children's rights provisions in the Constitution. Succinctly, the 1996 Constitution of Cameroon contains no Bill of Rights. The few rights provisions in the Constitution are all inscribed in the preamble with little or no substantive context. For example, one of the rights protected in the preamble vaguely provides that, 'the Nation shall protect and promote the family which is the natural foundation of human society. It shall protect women, the young, the elderly and the disabled.' At a time of increasing demand to adequately protect children's rights in Africa, it is difficult to fathom how Cameroon intends to protect its children with such limited constitutional provisions.

A positive clause in terms of children's constitutional rights is Article 65 of the Constitution which stipulates that the preamble is part and parcel of the Constitution. Although the preamble of a constitution is not, generally, justiciable in a court of law, in Cameroon, it is. However, this is not sufficient, because the lack of depth in the provisions related to children is probably a strong contributor to the massive children's rights violations registered in Cameroon. The lack of specific Acts of parliament related to children, to strengthen children's rights protection seems to condemn the state to failing further in its statutory obligation to protect its children. Apart from children's right to education, protected in paragraph 18 of the preamble, which opines that 'the State shall guarantee the child's right to education. Primary education shall be compulsory. The organisation and supervision of education at all levels shall be the duty of the State,' the Constitution protects no other socio-economic right that is directly ascribed to children.¹⁶

According to O'Mahony, 'the absence of specific constitutional protection for children's rights [in a Constitution] can be the very reason for the subordination of children's interests to those of adults.'¹⁷ This is critical because, in other African countries, for example, Kenya,¹⁸ South Africa¹⁹ and Nigeria,²⁰ children's rights have been incorporated in the Constitution, and further expanded through other Acts of parliament, which at the National level in these countries, have provided the much needed dynamic influence to shape the jurisprudential literature review of children's rights protection. The major difference between these countries and Cameroon is that they have legislation in place that provide the necessary legal support for a child who is

¹⁶ A Akonumbo, 'Indirect Constitutional Protection of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights in Cameroon' In D Chirwa and L Chenwi (eds) *The Protection of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights in Africa: International, Regional and National Perspectives* (Cambridge University Press 2016) 527–549.

¹⁷ C O'Mahony. 'Constitutional Protection of Children's Rights: Visibility, Agency and Enforceability' *Human Rights Law Review 2019*, 1–34 <doi: 10.1093/hrlr/ngz017> accessed 15 May 2022.

¹⁸ Kenya 'The Children's Act 2001'.

¹⁹ See eg South Africa Children's Act 38 of 2005.

²⁰ Constitution of Nigeria 1999 chapter 5.

- in conflict with the law. The existence of these pieces of legislation is significant to protect and guarantee the rights of the children in South Africa, Kenya and Nigeria.
- 151 This legislative gap in Cameroon is regrettable, but all is not lost. One way of construing
- any form of protection for children in the Constitution is by interpreting expressions
- generally used, such as 'everyone,' 'all citizens,' and 'every person.'²¹ These
- expressions are inclusive and indeed mean everyone and by extension underline one of
- the key objectives of the African Children's Charter and the CRC, which is that children
- are human rights holders alongside adults. However, as the UN Committee on the CRC,
- rightly points out, the test must be in the application of the rights and whether they are
- truly realised for children and directly invoked before a court of law.²²
- Another method to relate the limited children's rights protected in the Constitution, is
- through an expansive interpretative approach²³ with children as beneficiaries. This
- method of interpretation establishes a wider coverage of these rights and include
- children as beneficiaries of the rights protected without distorting the textual context in
- the Constitution. The obvious responsibility of legal representatives in courts will be to
- stretch the normative content of these rights, convince the court and then in the process
- claim these rights for children. The author believes that this could be the plausible way
- to finesse such loose constitutional rights existent in the Constitution of Cameroon.
- Thus, any attempt to relate or suggest such rights (initially intended for adults) to
- children, for example, could come down to a technicality.

Other Children's Laws in Cameroon

- 170 Cameroon lacks sufficient laws that separately and comprehensively protect children's
- 171 rights. Sporadically, the state issues Decrees, Orders, Ordinances and Ministerial
- 172 Instructions to respond to certain and specific aspects of children's rights.²⁴ Some of

²¹ These terms are the most popular expressions used in the Constitution. They are inclusive and do denote all people—but key to the general development of rights is specific protection of specific groups of people. The term 'children' does not exist in the Cameroonian Constitution, rather it is incorporated in these phrases.

The committee on the CRC has defined implementation as 'the process whereby States parties take action to ensure the realization of all rights in the Convention for all children in their jurisdiction.' See CRC General Comment 5 in 'General Measures of Implementation of the Convention on the Rights of the Child (2003) CRC/GC/2003/5 para 1. Implementation, in the context of international human rights law, has also been defined by the UN OHCHR as 'moving from a legal commitment, that is, acceptance of an international human rights obligation, to realization by the adoption of appropriate measures and ultimately the enjoyment by all of the rights enshrined under the related obligations'; UN, 'Report of the High Commissioner for Human Rights on Implementation of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights' E/2009/90 (2009) para 3.

This approach gives wider effect to a legal provision both subjectively and objectively. For details on this interpretation, see, S Dothan 'In Defence of Expansive Interpretation in the European Court of Human Rights' (2014) Cambridge Journal of International and Comparative Law 508–531.

²⁴ CRC Committee, 'Consideration of Reports Submitted by States Parties under Article 44 of the Convention – Cameroon' CRC/C/28/Add.16 para 19.

these laws are outdated²⁵ or imported—outdated laws from neighbouring Nigeria and 173 applicable mostly in the English- speaking regions (common law) of Cameroon.²⁶ For 174 example, in the second half of the twentieth century, four pieces of legislation 175 (Circulars) intended to protect children were promulgated into law. These are: Circular 176 on Pre-trial Detention of Minors.²⁷ Circular on Juvenile Delinquents and Runaway 177 Children, ²⁸ Circular on Methods of Investigation in Relation to the Adoption of 178 Children²⁹ and Circular on the Authorisation of Temporary Child Custody.³⁰ These were 179 also captured in the state's Report of 2009 to the Committee on the CRC as current legal 180 protection accorded to children in Cameroon.³¹ 181

Another elusive piece of legislation, which can also be used to protect children in 182 Cameroon is Ordinance No 81/02 of 19 June 1981³² and the French Civil Code.³³ 183 Through these instruments, children's rights are guaranteed, directly or through a 184 representative in legal and administrative proceedings, in cases related to custody, 185 186 divorce or separation proceedings in marriage and in hearings in the Council Chamber. These pieces of legislation, which Cameroon has flagged in several State reports as one 187 of its laws that protect children's rights in Cameroon, are old and out of touch with the 188 current developments in Children's rights jurisprudence in Africa and globally. For 189 190 example, even though the African Children's Committee has repeatedly condemned child marriage in Africa, Cameroon's Ordinance No 81/02 of 19 June 1981 promotes it. 191 192 In this Ordinance, Article 52(1) holds that '[n]o marriage may be celebrated if the girl 193 is below the age of 15 years or the boy below the age of 18 years, except under an 194 exemption granted by the President of the Republic for serious reasons.'34 This provision, is problematic, for two reasons. The first, is a child's right to non-195 196 discrimination in terms of its gender and age. The second, as indicated earlier, the provision approves of child marriage.³⁵ These are undisputable contradictions to 197

For example, the 1804 Napoleonic Civil Code, the Act of 24 July 1889 oN the Protection of Ill-treated and Abandoned Children, the Act of 19 April 1898 on the Punishment of Violence, Assault, Acts of Cruelty and Offences Against Children, the Decree of 30 November 1928 establishing special courts and the probation system for minors, the Decree of 30 October 1935 on the Protection of Children, the Decree of 23 September 1954 on the Family Record Book.

For example, Juveniles Courts Rules, CAP 32 of the 1958 Laws of the Federation of Nigeria. The irony here is that Nigeria has long consolidated and improved its child law legislation in the Child's Right Act of 2003.

²⁷ No. 9062/DJAS of 15 July 1967.

²⁸ No. 300018/DJAS/of 8 July 1968.

²⁹ No. 522/MSAP/DAS/BDI of 27 June 1974.

³⁰ No. 81/0018/LC/MINAS/SPFI of 18 September 1981.

³¹ Committee on the CRC (n 24). Access to these laws is difficult and almost impossible. Consequently, any attempt to quote and analyse any provision protected in any of these circulars, is a risk this contribution cannot take as it will be mere speculation.

³² On the organisation of the civil register Arts 52(1) and 64(1).

³³ See Art 238.

³⁴ See also Art 488 of the Civil Code.

³⁵ Article 21.

198 Cameroon's commitment to the African Children's Charter, to uphold, at all times the best interests of the child.

In 1990, the state promulgated two laws that are not directly intended for children but could, through expansive interpretation, extend to safeguard children's rights. These are the Act on Freedom of Social Communication,³⁶ and the Act on Freedom of Association.³⁷ Although not directly intended to protect children, both Acts protect some aspects of children's rights—for example, a child's right to freedom of expression and of association. Like the other laws stated above, these Acts of parliament are elusive— especially because they are inaccessible.

Two other pieces of legislation which could perhaps be identified as central to protecting children's rights and possibly clear the inconsistencies in terms of age disparity and other related issues, are still in draft stages. Unfortunately, the laws have not been promulgated and have been shelved as draft laws for over ten years, and still counting. These laws, (the Persons and Family Code and the Child Protection Code), are specifically intended to extensively address a number of issues ranging from the best interests of the child to the protection of the family environment.³⁸ It is crucial that stakeholders, especially lawmakers and policy drivers in Cameroon, expedite the process of adopting these laws because without a clear statute at the national level that protects children and gives them assurances, Cameroon will continuously be regarded as a less child-friendly state. Legislation is one of the most important instruments of government in organising society and protecting its citizens within its national territory. Amongst others, legislation outline the rights and responsibilities of individuals and authorities who govern. Legislation will have little value if there is neither discipline nor enforcement mechanisms, for example, through the establishment of key institutions, discussed below.

International Children's Law in Cameroon

207

208 209

210

211 212

213

214

215 216

217 218

219

220 221

222

223

224

225

226

227 228

229 230

231

232

Perhaps because the State is conscious of its children's rights legislative lacuna at the national level, Cameroon has ratified almost all significant international instruments that protect children's rights. Its ratification of, for example, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (1984), the Covenant on Economic Social and Cultural Rights (1984), the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CAT) (1986), the CRC (1993), Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (1994), the African Children's Charter (1997), the Convention on the Rights of People with Disability (2008), African Women's Protocol (2012) and the Optional Protocol to the Convention

³⁶ No. 90/53 of 19 December 1990.

³⁷ No. 90/53 of December 1990.

³⁸ See eg Child Protection Code draft ss 5, 18 & 42 of the draft.

- on the Rights of the Child on the involvement of children in armed conflict (2013) show pre-emptive intentions by the state to protect its citizens, and especially children.
- 235 Through Article 45 of the Constitution, which recognises ratified international law
- instruments at the highest echelon of legally binding instruments in Cameroon—with
- or without national law protection, ratified international laws are prioritised in courts of
- law and in the general protection of children's rights in this case. Hence, thanks to
- Article 45 (which demonstrates Cameroon's monist approach to international law) and
- 240 the ratification of these instruments, children can now claim, through a legal
- representative,³⁹ their rights available to them.
- This article does not address the level at which these international law instruments have
- been referred to in local courts to protect children in conflict with the law, as research
- 244 revealed that there is little or no reference to international law, in matters related to
- 245 children in Cameroon courts. Notwithstanding, the benefits of the ratification of the
- international treaties are significant, mainly through article 45 of the Constitution.
- Suggestively, adherence to international instruments can and should be seen as a 'quick-
- 248 fix' attempt by the government to fill the legislative gap that exists at national level, due
- 249 to the severe shortage of laws that protect children's rights in Cameroon. But, proper
- incorporation of these international laws is critical because it is the only means through
- 251 which these rights could be redirected to the realities faced by children in Cameroon.

State Institutions in Cameroon

252

253 Article 4 of the CRC, for example, calls on state parties to take 'appropriate ... administrative and other measures for the implementation of the rights recognized in 254 255 the ... Convention.' The technical inclusion of 'other measures' in this provision of the CRC is progressive in that it also refers to the establishment of monitoring institutions 256 257 at national level. Consequently, the establishment of institutions that promote and protect children's rights, such as the National Commission on Human Rights and 258 259 Freedoms (NCHRF) in Cameroon, is an important mechanism to promote and ensure 260 the implementation of children's rights. This is necessary because according to the Committee on the CRC, the creation of, for example, the NCHRF falls 'within the 261 262 commitment made by States parties upon ratification to ensure the implementation of the Convention and advance the universal realization of children's rights.'. 40 From a 263 broader international law perspective, the position of the CRC is also corroborated by 264 Article 2(3) of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, of which 265

³⁹ MD Afuba 'The Constitutional Protection of Civil and Political Rights in Cameroon' (2006) *University of Botswana Law Journal* 68–69.

⁴⁰ CRC Committee, 'General Comment 2 on the Role of Independent National Human Rights Institutions in the Promotion and Protection of the Rights of the Child' *CRC/GC/2002/2* (2002) paras 1 and 4.

Cameroon is a state party, that obligates a state party to provide effective remedy for any person—including children—whose rights and freedoms are violated.

National Commission on Human Rights and Freedoms

268

278

279

280

281

282 283

284

285

286

287

288

289 290

291 292

293

294 295

296

269 Cameroon, as a state party, has a legal obligation under international law, to institutionalise children's rights at the national level. However, the country's lethargic 270 271 performance in domesticating or legislating child-friendly laws seems to affect its effort to establish child-friendly institutions. It is pointless to establish institutions to facilitate 272 redress when rights are violated under international law, without national legislation. 273 274 Legislation and relevant institutions complement one another. The logical starting point 275 is to legislate first, and Cameroon is not there yet. This is not to say that it has not institutionalised Children's rights—it has, but these institutions are weak and poorly 276 277 resourced.

At present, Cameroon's only prime institution with the potential to provide a national oversight over children's rights protection and promotion, is its NCHRF. The NCHRF was established in 1990, by a Presidential Decree. 41 It is, so far, the only state-funded institution with a mandate to monitor and promote human rights- related laws in Cameroon. On paper, it is an independent institution with the mandate to advise, observe, evaluate, discuss, debate, promote and protect issues of human rights and freedoms. 42 As the leading national human rights institution, the NCHRF is a central institution in protecting children's rights in Cameroon. 43 This is also because it enjoys national coverage with regional offices in eight of the country's ten regions. To facilitate its work on promoting children's rights, the NCHRF has established a sub-working group within the head office of the commission, with the broad mandate to promote the rights of vulnerable groups (including children). 44 In its 2013 activity report, the subcommittee in the NCHRF reported that it had conducted a study on educational activities in schools on the rights of the child.⁴⁵ From an analysis of existing reports on the activities of the NCHRF, this seems to be the only activity that the sub-committee has carried out in relation to children.

In search of answers and more information on the work of the NCHRF with regard to Cameroon's implementation of children's rights, the author spoke to one of its officials in 2020. It was noted that the NCHRF conducts hearings on issues such as child support

⁴¹ The NCHRF was established through Act No. 2004/016 of 22 July 2004, amended in 2010.

⁴² UN International Human Rights Instruments, 'Common Core Document Forming Part of the Reports of States Parties – Cameroon' UN/doc/HRI/CORE/CMR/2013 para 86.

^{43 &}lt;a href="http://www.cndhl.cm/index.php/organisation-de-la-cndhl">http://www.cndhl.cm/index.php/organisation-de-la-cndhl accessed 7 May 2015.

⁴⁴ For details on this working group, see http://www.cndhl.cm/index.php/les-sous-commissions/sous-commission-n-3 accessed 16 November 2019.

NCHRF, 'Activity Report' http://www.cndhl.cm/index.php/protection-et-promotion-des-droits-des-enfants/accessed 16 November 2019.

in cases where parents are divorced. ⁴⁶ During these sessions, the NCHRF makes decisions that are in the best interests of the child. ⁴⁷ This is noteworthy, as it is not reported in any of Cameroon's reports to the relevant treaty bodies at the time of writing this article, neither the AU nor the UN. Nonetheless, the fact that NCHRF has a mandate to adjudicate on child- related disputes is a positive development. Unfortunately, this mandate does not follow up with the powers to make binding decisions. As a result, the Commission functions more like a quasi-judicial body that makes recommendations with no powers to prosecute where there are clear violations of rights. ⁴⁸ The best alternative to an institution with powers to prosecute will be a court of law, which and will be discussed below under the heading 'Recommendations.'

National Commission to Protect Children at Risk, Juvenile Delinquents and Abandoned Children

In 2009 the state reported to the Committee on the CRC that a National Commission to Protect Children at Risk, Juvenile Delinquents and Abandoned Children⁴⁹ had been created⁵⁰ in the department of the Ministry of Social Affairs with the mandate to draw and oversee the monitoring and implementation strategies of the national children's policy.⁵¹ Also, in 2011, the state established an inter-ministerial committee within the office of the Prime Minister with the mandate to oversee the implementation of the recommendations and decisions from AU and UN organs. The state claims that placing this Committee within the office of the Prime Minister indicates the seriousness with which the State regards the organs of, for example, the AU.⁵² But, a glance on the

⁴⁶ In a telephone conversation with an official at the Commission, on Monday 4 May 2015, he confirmed the fact that the Commission has conducted several of such hearings and made decisions that compel a father, for example, of children from a divorced marriage to provide financial support to their child(ren). However, he also admitted that the process has not been completely smooth, especially in cases where a parent fails to make such contribution and the other refuses to act on the Commission's recommendation to approach the courts for financial reasons.

⁴⁷ ibid

⁴⁸ S Ebobrah, 'Reinforcing the Identity of the African Children's Rights Committee: A Case for Limiting the Lust for Judicial Powers in Quasi -Judicial Human Rights Mechanisms.' (2015) *The Transnational Human Rights Review* 1–31.

⁴⁹ The Commission serves as an umbrella entity to enhance the interaction between the various stakeholders in the interest of improved coherence, efficiency and impact of the National Children's Policy.

⁵⁰ Pursuant to Degree No. 90/524 of 23 March 1990.

Although reported in 2009, a similar Commission had been promulgated by Decree No. 90/524 of 23 March 1990, establishing the National Commission to Protect Children at Risk, Juvenile Delinquents and Abandoned Children. Several other institutions have also been created, including the National Committee to Combat Drug Abuse; the National Committee for the Social and Economic Rehabilitation and Reintegration of Disabled Person and the National Commission on Health and Safety at Work; the National Prison Administration Commission.

⁵² Interview conducted by Open Society Justice Initiative with Cameroon's then Minister of Justice, Mr. Hermine Kembo in 2013 https://www.justiceinitiative.org/uploads/7d34546e-dfe6-450b-82ec-77da3323d4bd/from-rights-to-remedies-20130708.pdf accessed 15 November 2019; interview granted by the former High Commission for Human Rights (Ms Navi Pillay) in Yaoundé at the end

- 318 website of the Prime Minister's office, to investigate the mandate of the inter-ministerial
- committee, left the viewer disappointed and prone to speculation about the possible
- dissolution of the inter-ministerial committee.⁵³ This could well be the case, as it is
- 321 supported further by the fact that Cameroon's periodic report submitted to the African
- 322 Children's Committee in 2015, did not mention this inter-ministerial committee, which
- 323 in 2013 was signposted as the answer to Cameroon's lethargic compliance with the
- decisions and recommendations from AU and UN organs.⁵⁴ Unless proven otherwise,
- 325 this committee does not exist.
- Furthermore, this possibly explains why the committee and the UN Committee on
- 327 Economic Social and Cultural Rights called on the state to establish effective
- monitoring units that will respond to the plight of children in Cameroon.⁵⁵ It is indeed
- 329 crucial for the state to establish, as a matter of urgency, an effective monitoring
- institution that will oversee the domestication and implementation of children's rights.
- The absence of an institution that could enforce and strengthen children's rights at the
- national level betrays the state's commitment to the international community to protect
- its children in a meaningful way.

The Courts

- At the judiciary level, there is no court specifically assigned to hear matters that concern
- children. Resultantly, depending on the matter, and especially issues related to custody,
- children are generally heard in the chambers of the Courts of First Instance, High Court
- or Court of Appeal, and in rare cases at the Supreme Court of Appeal.⁵⁶ The good news,
- is that unlike the NCHRF discussed earlier, the decisions of the courts are binding and
- 340 the court would prosecute those who violate its orders. Technically, it is difficult to
- register custody disputes as examples of ascertaining children's rights. This is because,
- the underpinning logic of custody cases is to assign a parent or both, custodial rights
- and powers to provide care for their child. However, there are elements of children's

of her first visit to Cameroon in which she said: 'The next step for Cameroon is to focus on rigorous implementation of recommendations from treaty bodies, special procedures and the Universal Periodic Review, so as to put in place a strong and inclusive human rights protection system for the benefit of its entire population' http://www.un.org/apps/news/story.asp?NewsID=45329#.VUjFamNfZ8E accessed 20 November 2019.

^{53 &}lt;a href="https://www.spm.gov.cm/">https://www.spm.gov.cm/> accessed 16 November 2019.

For details on this report, visit https://acerwc.africa/wp-content/uploads/2018/04/Cameroon_Periodic_Report_Eng.pdf accessed 16 November 2019.

⁵⁵ CESCR Concluding observations on the fourth periodic report of Cameroon UN E/C.12/CMR/CO/4.

For details on the jurisdiction of these courts, see, the Justice and Peace Commission Archdiocese of Bamenda 'Report on the Judicial System in Cameroon' http://www.justiceandpeacebamenda.org/attachments/article/24/The+Judicial+System+in+Cameroon.pdf> accessed 16 November 2019. See also the webpage of the Ministry of Social Affairs https://www.minas.gov.cm/index.php?view=article&id=167%3Aenfant-en-conflit-avec-la-

rights in such cases that have to be verified before custody is granted—but children's rights that are intricate in custody cases are aftermaths of the raison-d'etre of cases.⁵⁷ The reality is that Cameroon does not dispose of a Children's Court. 58 Even though there are hearings in the chambers on matters related to children, most of these cases are not reported and there is limited incentive to validate the rights of children protected in the African Children's Charter and the CRC. The institutionalisation of a children's courts as discussed below, will greatly improve Cameroon's child justice system. From a prosecutorial perspective, a court which holds hearings on children's rights issues, will, no doubt be a step up from the weak dispute resolution process at the NCHRF.

Recommendations

As indicated earlier, as per article 43(1) of the African Children's Charter, all state parties have a duty to report on 'the measures they have adopted which give effect to the provisions of the Charter and on the progress made in the enjoyment of these rights' at the national level. However, thirty-one years after the adoption of the Charter and twenty-two years since Cameroon ratified the Charter, the state has not satisfactorily domesticated the African Children's Charter. This is particularly due to the fact that, the state has not, from a legislative and institutional perspective, paid sufficient attention to adopt domestic laws and establish national institutions with specific focus on children's rights.

State commitment to children's rights must be prioritised at all times. Childhood is a special epoch in human life and children represent the only human group protected under international human rights law with an 'expiry date' (eighteen years) in terms of their rights protection. After eighteen, they move into another group (adulthood) with another set of rights. This is justification enough why the state should, as a matter of urgency, ensure that it doubles its effort to enact progressive child-friendly laws. It must also ensure that the NCHRF is provided with adequate human, technical and financial resources to strengthen and effectively carry out its mandate to respond adequately to the plight of children in Cameroon. This includes extending the mandate of the NCHRF to lead the process to harmonise and update all aspects of Cameroon's legislation related to children.

A unitary codification or, at the minimum, a contemporary Child Law Act which comprehensively protects children's rights in Cameroon will benefit the entire child justice system. It will enable easy accessibility and propel the proper development of its

E Fokala, 'The Impact of the Best Interests and the Respect for the Views of the Child Principles in Child Custody Cases' 2019 Nordic Journal of International Law 13–20; See also, A Akonumbo 'Excursion into the Best Interests of the Child Principle in Family Law and Child-related Laws and Policies in Cameroon' 2010 *The International Survey of Family Law* 63–94.

⁵⁸ S Tabe, 'A Critical Appraisal of the Juvenile Justice System under Cameroon's 2005 Criminal Procedure Code: Emerging Challenges" 2012 PELJ 148–428.

377 provisions and children's rights in general. It will also, from a Cameroonian perspective, undoubtedly establish a springboard from which the contextual normative expansion of 378 critical children's rights is developed to provide better protection for children. Once 379 these laws have been harmonised, there will be a need for a special court or tribunal that 380 deals specifically with children's issues. Critically, it will make these rights justiciable 381 in a court of law. It will allow children the opportunity to claim their rights if they have 382 been violated or neglected. Currently, as indicated above, children can only claim their 383 rights through hearings in chambers. This is not enough as the urgency around children's 384 385 issues requires that they must be given a full hearing with the agency that they deserve.

The Importance of a Progressive and Supportive Legal and Policy Reform at National
Level

Like all state parties, Cameroon is mainly dependent on the national actions of the state 388 when it comes to the translation of children's rights into reality.⁵⁹ One of the methods 389 to transpose international law provisions to respond to the domestic plight of children's 390 391 rights, is through domestication/incorporation of treaty principles or norms into national legal and policy reforms. Legal and policy reforms are, jointly, a key component in the 392 393 effective implementation of the specific intent of any children's rights provision in the African Children's Charter. 60 For example, at the United Nations (UN) level, Article 4 394 of the CRC, calls on state parties to take all appropriate legislative, administrative and 395 396 other measures to implement the rights recognised in the Convention. The Committee on the CRC, in interpreting the scope of article 4, declares that the request made in 397 Article 4 'should be considered of fundamental importance for the implementation of 398 the Convention.'61 399

The African Children's Charter echoes similar measures in its article 1(1), in which it calls on state parties 'to adopt such legislative or other measures as may be necessary to give effect to the provisions of [the] Charter.' Although similar to the provision of Article 4 of the CRC, the weight of the obligation to state parties in the Charter is different and weaker when compared to the weight of the obligation in the CRC. The Charter uses 'or' as opposed to 'and' as is the case in the CRC. The use of 'or' in the Charter gives state parties the option to either take only legislative measures or other measures, whereas the CRC is stricter, as it requires state parties to adopt both legislative

400

401

402

403

404

405 406

See generally, L Lundy and others, 'Incorporation of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child in Law' in M Freeman (ed) *The Future of Children's Rights* (Brill 2014) 305. See also, J Donnelly, *Universal Human Rights in Theory and Practice* (Cornell University Press Ithaca and London 2013) 171, in which he asserts that 'the fate of human rights – is largely a matter of national, not international, action.'.

⁶⁰ P Alston and J Tobin, Laying the Foundations for Children's Rights: An Independent Study of some Key Legal and Institutional Aspects of the Impact of the Convention on the Rights of Children (UNICEF 2005) 28–30.

⁶¹ CRC Report on the Twenty-second Session CRC/C/90 (1999) para 291(d).

and other measures in their effort to incorporate international law principles into national laws.

The textual difference concerning state party obligation in both instruments is contextually problematic. Nonetheless, both instruments have striking similarities both in text, context and scope. They are the only two mainstream children's rights instruments applicable in Cameroon. As a result, there is bound to be some complications in terms of preference and applicability. Accordingly, Doek advises that the preferred method chosen by a state, for example, at the African regional level, at the minimum, entails '... activities of a government to ensure that national laws and related administrative regulations are in full compliance ...' with mainstream treaties that it has ratified. Therefore, Cameroon is obliged to domesticate and fulfil its mandate under both instruments. In cases where there are textual and technical differences as indicated above, the state must apply its mind to the provision that will best protect children. Progressive prioritisation between these two children's rights instruments is crucial. As Viljoen correctly points out, these two instruments are not in an 'oppositional but rather complimentary relationship' in the context of children's rights protection in Africa. 63

Conclusion

The adoption of a consolidated children's rights statute at national level represents a valuable opportunity for the state to incorporate and protect all aspects of children's rights. However, the problem lies with implementation, which is crucial because it gives meaning to the laws enacted and provides a means of evaluating the institutions created. It is also the final determinant in the general protection of rights. However, Goonesekere acknowledges that in some developing countries, legislative reforms may be viewed with cynicism as, in practice, law enforcement is generally weak and public awareness of the rights enshrined in such treaties (and to some extent national laws) is low or at worse, non-existent. She goes on to add that '... legal procedures are either inaccessible or ineffective to give relief and remedies from injustice and abuse of power" in most developing countries. '64

Therefore, in Cameroon, any legal reform with the common objective of putting the law in place to protect children's rights is insufficient to achieve the objective of domesticating children's rights. What is crucial is the next step after legislation, which will be a satisfactory implementation. A proper implementation requires the institutionalisation of children's rights. Appropriate institutions with the mandate to

⁶² J Doek, Harmonisation of Laws on Children: Some Practical Guidance (2007) 2 https://app.box.com/s/ca19481c7d5dc225abff> accessed 12 May 2022.

⁶³ F Viljoen International Human Rights Law in Africa (Oxford University Law Press 2012) 392.

⁶⁴ S Goonesekere, Children, Law and Justice: A South Asian Perspective (UNICEF 1998) 355. Although this work is set in an Asian context, the logic is equally true and applicable in the African context.

- 441 monitor and implement children's rights at the national level provide the required bridge
- legislation and enjoyment of such rights. Sloth-Nielsen concurs and rightly points out
- that a comprehensive domestication of the Charter, for example, is not only the preserve
- of a parliamentary activity through the enactment of laws but also the jurisprudence and
- activities emanating from institutions such as the courts. 65

446 Bibliography

Journal Articles

- Afuba MD, 'The Constitutional Protection of Civil and Political Rights in Cameroon' (2006) *University of Botswana Law Journal* 67–92.
 - Akonumbo A, 'Excursion into the Best Interests of the Child Principle in Family Law and Child-related Laws and Policies in Cameroon' 2010 *The International Survey of Family Law* 63–94.
 - Bequele A, 'Monitoring the Commitment and Child-friendliness of Governments: A New Approach from Africa' 2010 *Child Abuse & Neglect* 34–44.
 - Dothan S, 'In Defence of Expansive Interpretation in the European Court of Human Rights' (2014) *Cambridge Journal of International and Comparative Law* 508–531.
 - Ebobrah S, 'Reinforcing the Identity of the African Children's Rights Committee: A Case for Limiting the Lust for Judicial Powers in Quasi -Judicial Human Rights Mechanisms.' (2015) *The Transnational Human Rights Review* 1–31.
 - Fokala E, 'The Impact of the Best Interests and the Respect for the Views of the Child Principles in Child Custody Cases' 2019 *Nordic Journal of International Law* 614–635.
 - Lloyd A, 'The first meeting of the African Committee of Experts on the Rights and Welfare of the Child' 2002 *AHRJ* 320 326.
 - O'Mahony C, 'Constitutional Protection of Children's Rights: Visibility, Agency and Enforceability' *Human Rights Law Review* 2019, 1–34
 - Sloth-Nielsen J, 'Children's Rights in Africa' in Ssenyonjo (ed), *The African Regional Human Rights System*; 30 years after the African Charter on Human and People's Rights (Brill 2012) 155 176.
 - Tabe S, "A Critical Appraisal of the Juvenile Justice System under Cameroon's 2005 Criminal Procedure Code: Emerging Challenges" 2012 PELJ 148–428.

Book Chapters

Akonumbo A, 'Indirect Constitutional Protection of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights in Cameroon' In D Chirwa and L Chenwi (eds) *The Protection of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights in Africa: International, Regional and National Perspectives* (Cambridge University Press 2016) 527–549.

Laura L, Kilkelly U, and Byrne B, 'Incorporation of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child in Law' in M Freeman (ed) *The Future of Children's Rights* (Brill 2014) 305 – 350.

J Sloth-Nielsen, 'Children's Rights in Africa' in M Ssenyonjo (ed), The African Regional Human Rights System; 30 years after the African Charter on Human and People's Rights (Brill 2012) 171.

484	
485	

487

488

489

485 **Books** 486

Donnelly J, *Universal Human Rights in Theory and Practice* (Cornell University Press Ithaca and London 2013)

Viljoen F, *International Human Rights Law in Africa* (Oxford University Law Press 2012)

490 491 492 493

494

495

Cases

Institute for Human Rights and Development in Africa and Finders Group Initiative on behalf of TFA (a minor) v the government the Republic of Cameroon, Communication No: 006/Com/002/2015 Decision No:001/2018 16.

Legislation

500 501

National

502 503

- Circular on Pre-trial Detention of Minors, No. 9062/DJAS of 15 July 1967.
- Circular on Juvenile Delinquents and Runaway Children No. 300018/DJAS/of 8 July 1968.
- Circular on Methods of Investigation in Relation to the Adoption of Children No.
- 507 522/MSAP/DAS/BDI of 27 June 1974
- 508 Circular on the Authorization of Temporary Child Custody No.
- 509 81/0018/LC/MINAS/SPFI of 18 September 1981.
- 510 Kenyan Children's Act 2001.
- 511 South Africa Children's Act 38 of 2005.
- 512 Constitution of Nigeria 1999.
- 513 Degree No. 90/524 of 23 March 1990.
- The Act on Freedom of Association No. 90/53 of December 1990.
- Act on Freedom of Social Communication No. 90/53 of 19 December 1990.
- 516 Act No. 2004/016 of 22 July 2004, amended in 2010.

517

518

519 Treaties

520 521

- The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights 16 December 1966,
- The Covenant on Economic Social and Cultural Rights 16 December 1966,
- The Convention against Torture and Other Cruel Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment 10 December 1984,
- The United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child 20 November 1989,
- Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women 3 September 1981,
- The African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child 11 July 1990,
- The Convention on the Rights of People with Disability 13 December 2006,
- Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa 01 July 2003.
- The Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the involvement of children in armed conflict 25 May 2000.

534 535

Reports

_	1	_
ר	≺	h

541 542

543

544

545

546

547

548

549

550

564

565

566

- Goonesekere S, Children, Law and Justice: A South Asian Perspective (UNICEF –
 Innocenti Florence 1998)
- Doek J, *Harmonisation of Laws on Children: Some Practical Guidance* (African Child
 Policy Forum 2007)
 - United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child Report on the Twenty-second Session CRC/C/90 (1999)
 - Alston P and Tobin J, Laying the Foundations for Children's Rights: An Independent Study of some Key Legal and Institutional Aspects of the Impact of the Convention on the Rights of Children (UNICEF Innocenti Florence 2005)
 - CESCR Concluding observations on the fourth periodic report of Cameroon UN E/C.12/CMR/CO/4
 - NCHRF, 'Activity Report' http://www.cndhl.cm/index.php/rapports-edh-et-rapports-d-activites and http://www.cndhl.cm/index.php/protection-et-promotion-des-droits-des-enfants
- United Nations International Human Rights Instruments, 'Common Core Document Forming Part of the Reports of States Parties – Cameroon' UN/doc/HRI/CORE/CMR/2013
- 554 The Justice and Peace Commission Archdiocese of Bamenda 'Report on the Judicial 555 System in Cameroon' http://www.justiceandpeacebamenda.org/attachments/article/24/The+Judicial+Sy 556 stem+in+Cameroon.pdf> accessed16 November 2019. See also the webpage of the 557 558 Ministry of Social Affairs <www.minas.gov.cm> and Children in Conflict with the 559 http://www.minas.gov.cm/index.php?view= article&id=167%3Aenfant-enconflit-avec-la-loi&format=pdf&option=com content&Itemid=189&lang=en 560
- CRC Committee, 'General Comment 2 on the Role of Independent National Human Rights Institutions in the Promotion and Protection of the Rights of the Child' CRC/GC/2002/2 (2002)
 - United Nations Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, available at file:///C:/Users/u05127913/Downloads/GL032748.pdf
 - The African Child Policy Forum, The African Report on Child Wellbeing: How Child-friendly are African Governments?
- United States Department of State Bureau of Democracy 2012 report on human rights in Cameroon available at http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/204309.pdf
- 571 CRC General Comment 5 in 'General Measures of Implementation of the Convention on the Rights of the Child (2003) CRC/GC/2003/5
- 573 UN, 'Report of the High Commissioner for Human Rights on Implementation of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights' E/2009/90 (2009)